

## **Can global governance in the post-2015 era become inclusive, accountable and transformative towards a more equitable and sustainable world?**

### **Toward a research agenda**

Ralph Bunche Institute for International Studies  
The Graduate Center, CUNY  
365 Fifth Avenue, between 34 & 35 Streets  
New York City

**14 March 2016**

#### **Scope, focus and methodology of the workshop**

The scope, focus, and methodology of this workshop have been determined in dialogue with the participants, through their reactions to a draft discussion document prepared and circulated by the organizers. A substantial consensus has emerged regarding the objective to be pursued, as illustrated by the following excerpts from participants' comments, although some have exhibited a certain degree of pessimism or skepticism concerning the likelihood of attaining it:

- How to build a "global public sphere", strengthening sites and practices of "people-centered alternative global governance", and how to address and tame practices of TNCs and global financial interests (Barry Gills).
- Understanding the structure of power within the global political economy and redressing political imbalances created in a very interdependent but unequal world (Craig Murphy).
- How can citizen pressure and practice from below generate governance support for an emergent world we like? What strategy can be adopted in the Westphalian present with a view to a very different future (Harriet Friedmann)?
- What shifts in norms/ideas and openings in economic dynamics/structures are needed to enable new governance frameworks to bring more transformative change (Jennifer Clapp).
- What concrete steps can advance more desirable forms of governance embodying very different relations between people and the earth, among states, between states and people who live in them (Jackie Smith).

Any one of the topics to be discussed in the workshop could be the subject of an entire seminar. Often they are treated separately, and it is hoped that linking them in a single discussion can help to construct a strategic overview of the issues involved. Each topic will be introduced by three "kick-off" speakers, who will have five minutes each to express a few key ideas leaving 35 minutes for discussion. The aim, obviously, is not to explore the questions exhaustively, but rather to define and flesh them out for further research and reflection. Follow-up to the workshop will be discussed in a final, forward-looking wrap-up session.

The majority of the participants are academics, while others come from the worlds of government, civil society and social movements (see attached list). An effort has been made to frame questions in ways that speak to problems encountered in real life in order to help bridge the gap between theory and practice.

## Programme

**Welcoming coffee** (8:30-9:00)

**Moderator:** T. Weiss

**Opening** (9:00-9:20)

- Welcome to participants – T. Weiss
- Aims and programme of the workshop – N. McKeon and P-M Aubert
- Round the table introductions

**Part 1 : Setting the scene** (9:20-10:20)

This opening section is intended to briefly contextualize the discussions, without seeking consensus on a single interpretation, and to present two quite different innovative governance initiatives.

*Contexts and problematics of global governance today* (9:20-9:55)

J. Scholte: *Complexity and transcalarity of global governance*

P. Cerny: *'Neopluralist coalitions', fragmentation and democracy deficits*

B. Gills: *Global governance and the long history of global capitalism.*

Discussion

*Two examples of innovative global governance initiatives* (9:55-10:20)

Committee on World Food Security and Global Redesign Initiative: N. McKeon, C. Murphy

Discussion

**Part 2: Addressing power relations in global governance**

*Structural, discursive and institutional power of the corporate private and financial sectors and complicity of states. How do they operate? Can they be tamed?* (10:20-11:10)

Kick-off speakers: P. McMichael, J. Clapp, R. Broad

Discussion

Coffee break 11:10-11:30

*Multistakeholderism and multilateralism: instrument for inclusion or for corporate capture?* (11:30-12:15)

Kick-off speakers: B. Adams, F. Biermann,

Discussion

**Part 3: In search of countervailing power and practice**

Countervailing power – in the view of a number of participants - originates with people and communities who are disempowered and dispossessed, in different ways and to greater or lesser degrees, in today's scenario. They discover and exercise this power in seeking to defend their rights, livelihoods, and values and in building alternative practices that are more protective of the commons than those they contest. The question for this workshop is to reflect on ways in which global governance could provide such countervailing power and practices with safer space in which to build their strength.

*Introduction through a concrete example: the food sovereignty movement* (12:15-12:30)

S. Araujo

Discussion

Lunch break - 12:30-1:30

*Starting off where people can best engage and diversity can thrive (1:30-2:20)*

Kick off speakers and focus questions:

C. Murphy (*Harnessing the power of subsidiarity*)

H. Friedmann (*Territorial/ landscape governance*)

T. Forster (*Vertical networking of local governance sites*)

Discussion

*Holding power wielders accountable: political and governance processes (2:20-3:10)*

Kick-off speakers:

P. Newell (*accountability by whom, for whom, for what purpose?*)

O. Rebedea (*accountability, inclusiveness and global governance mechanisms*)

M. Edelman (*Can the HR Council work for peasants and against TNCs?*)

Discussion

Coffee break 3:10-3:30

*Holding power wielders accountable: normative frameworks, knowledge sources, discursive change (3:30-4:20)*

Kick-off speakers:

H. Elver (*How to use the HR framework to strengthen accountability*)

J. Smith (*Beyond western modernist epistemologies*)

M. Anderson (*Knowledge sources and valuation: opening up to different languages*)

*What changes could be introduced into multilateral/multi-actor governance to promote the conditions for reflexive, discursive democracy in a global public sphere? (4:20-5:10)*

Kick-off speakers: L. Orrenius, A. Narang, R. Falk

Discussion

#### **Part 4: What next ? ( 5:10 – 6:00)**

*Key insights emerging from the day's discussions.*

The moderators/rapporteurs of the previous sessions will briefly recall the main points that will have emerged from the debate, followed by a brief discussion to complete/correct the summary.

*Possible immediate products*

The following possibilities have been advanced thus far. They should be discussed and others may be suggested.

- A report should be made available to the participants and could merit wider distribution.
- *Globalizations* has expressed interest in publishing an account of the workshop debates.
- The idea of producing a policy brief that could be relevant to current evolutions in global governance mechanisms has been advanced. IDDRI and Terra Nuova would be willing to take the lead.

*Future research/publication/debate opportunities*

Participants should consider whether they would be interested in taking this initiative a step further. The following possibilities have been suggested. Participants may have other ideas.

- Developing a proposal for a special issue of a journal or for an edited book.
- Making an application for a workshop in connection with ISA 2017 that would provide an opportunity for deeper debate on the key issues and/or for discussion of papers that could compose the journal/edited book.
- Organizing a public symposium bringing together academics, practitioners and social movements. This would require mobilizing financial support.

**Following the close of the workshop participants are invited to dinner in a near-by restaurant.**

## List of participants

	<b>Participant</b>	<b>Institution</b>	<b>Interests</b>
1	Thomas G. Weiss	Graduate Center, CUNY	UN, multilateralism, humanitarianism, human rights
2	Pierre-Marie Aubert	IDDDRI	Environmental policies, governance of value-chains.
3	Carole-Anne S�nit	IDDDRI	Earth system governance, civil society processes.
4	Nora McKeon	Rome 3 U.	Global governance, social movements
5	David Weaver	Global Policy Forum	Global policies, food, civil society participation
6	Thomas Foster	The New School	Local food systems; local authorities
7	Molly Anderson	Middlebury	Food systems, multi-actor processes, monitoring/accountability
8	Jan Aart Scholte	U. of Gothenburg	Globalization, global governance, civil society and global democracy, methodologies of global studies.
9	Philip Cerny	Rutgers (emeritus)	Global governance, transnational pluralism.
10	Jennifer Clapp	Waterloo	Global food and environment governance, transnational corporations.
11	Marc Edelman	Hunter College/CUNY Grad Center	Economic and political anthropology, agrarian social movements and human rights frameworks
12	Robin Broad	American University	Economic globalization, environment and development, accountability
13	Barry Gills	Helsinki U.	Political economy of globalization, cosmopolitanism
14	Harriet Friedmann	U. of Toronto (emeritus)	Food regimes, food systems
14	Craig Murphy	U. Mass	Multi-level democratization
15	Jackie Smith	U. of Pittsburgh	Global Political Economy and Social Movements, Human Rights Cities
16	Lisa Orrenius	Dag Hammarskj�ld Foundation	UN system renewal
17	Hilal Elver	UCSB + UCLA	Human rights-Right to Food
18	Richard Falk	UCSB + Princeton	Human rights, governance
19	Barbara Adams	Global Policy Forum	United Nations, civil society, private sector influence
20	Oana Rebedea	UN Perm. Mission Romania	Accountability, inclusiveness, relations global governance to other levels
21	S�bastien Treyer	IDDDRI	Environmental policies and governance
22	Peter Newell	Sussex U.	Environment and development, climate change
23	Philip McMichael	Cornell U.	Agrarian systems, food regimes, food movements

24	Frank Biermann	Utrecht U.	Global sustainability governance
25	Saulo Araujo	WHY Hunger	Food sovereignty
26	Amit Narang	UN Perm. Mission Indi	Inclusiveness of global governance